

Department of Public Works – Engineering Division

MEMO

TO: Utilities Committee

FROM: Paula Vandehey, Director of Public Works
Pete Neuberger, Staff Engineer
Sue Olson, Staff Engineer

DATE: August 24, 2021

RE: Award of 2021I Stormwater Consulting Services Contract for Apple Creek Road/Haymeadow Avenue Study and 30% Design with McMahon Associates in an amount not to exceed \$40,217

The Department of Public Works is requesting approval of the 2021I Stormwater Consulting Services Contract for Apple Creek Road/Haymeadow Avenue Study and 30% Design with McMahon Associates in an amount not to exceed \$40,217. After this contract, \$273,025 will remain in the 2021 stormwater consulting services budget.

In recent years, the Department of Public Works has experienced significant interest among land owners and developers to develop land within north side City growth areas. The City of Appleton Department of Public Works (DPW) issued Request for Proposals to help prepare for anticipated development in a currently undeveloped City growth area east of STH 47 and south of CTH JJ. Within this area, the City plans to construct the following collector streets in approximately six years:

- Haymeadow Avenue from approximately 900 feet south of CTH JJ to 2,950 feet south of CTH JJ
- Apple Creek Road from STH 47 to approximately 2,500 feet east

DNR NR151, the City's stormwater management ordinance (Chapter 20 of Article VI, Municipal Code), and the Upper Fox/Wolf TMDL include standards for new transportation facilities development that these City projects will be required to follow.

Additionally, DPW anticipates that when the surrounding undeveloped area develops as one or more new residential subdivisions, the development(s) will be required to obtain a stormwater permit and meet the ordinance requirements for new development. The City of Appleton has a boundary agreement with the Town of Grand Chute that indicates areas east of STH 47, including this area, will be annexed to the City to receive sanitary sewer and water service at the time of development.

The contract scope for the selected consultant includes:

- Prepare an independent drainage study that details the stormwater conveyances and stormwater management practices necessary for the two planned roadways to meet applicable standards.
 - One alternative to provide stormwater pond(s) with no additional effort toward optimizing for treatment of runoff beyond the proposed roadways
 - A second alternative to provide stormwater pond(s) with reasonable effort toward optimizing for treatment of runoff beyond the proposed roadways, to include all or most of the developable land within project planning area.
- Prepare cost estimates for each alternative, including potential public/private cost sharing calculations.
- Conduct coordination meetings with City staff
- Prepare 30% preliminary engineering plans for stormwater conveyances and stormwater management practices, as well as roadway design profiles.

DPW solicited proposals from four qualified engineering firms and received proposals from three of them. Technical proposals were first rated on a 100-point scale on the following criteria: Similar Project Experience, Project Team, Project Understanding and Approach, and Schedule. Technical proposals were evaluated by a City review team consisting of Ross Buetow, City Engineer; Sue Olson, Staff Engineer; and Pete Neuberger, Staff Engineer. After technical proposal scoring, the team reviewed the compensation proposals. Below are the scoring results, from lowest cost per point to highest.

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Firm</u>	<u>Score</u>	<u>Price</u>	<u>Price per Point</u>
1.	McMahon	94.00	\$35,300	\$376
2.	raSmith	86.67	\$59,252	\$684
3.	Brown & Caldwell	92.67	\$77,385	\$835

McMahon's and Brown & Caldwell's technical proposals both ranked very high, but McMahon's overall score was significantly better than the others once price was factored in. McMahon's proposal indicated they had previously performed a study for the Town of Grand Chute downstream of the City's project planning area, and as part of that effort they had already completed existing conditions modeling that included the area in question.

2021I Contract
August 24, 2021
-Page 3-

After completing the scoring, DPW staff negotiated with McMahon an additional 40 work hours, with associated costs, to increase coordination meeting and alternative analysis hours, bringing the total recommended contract cost to \$40,217 (\$428 per point, in updated scoring terms).

Based on their strong, cost-effective proposal and the quality of work on other City projects, DPW staff recommend award of the Stormwater Consulting Services contract for Apple Creek Road/Haymeadow Avenue Study and 30% Design with McMahon Associates. If McMahon performs satisfactorily during this contract, DPW staff anticipate negotiating future single source contracts with McMahon for final engineering design work in 2023, subject to Committee and Council approval at the appropriate time.