


memo

City of Appleton

To: Human Resources Committee
From: Sandy Behnke, HR Director 
CC: Common Council
Date: 6/7/2013
Re: Compensation Study

Pursuant to Council's directive of March 20, 2013, we are seeking ratification of staff's recommendation of the proposed Control Points on the attached grade order listing. This Grade Order Listing was approved by Council on May 15, 2013.

The directive that was approved stated:

"Work with the Human Resources Department to calculate market averages for wages utilizing previously collected public sector data and published private sector data, including the cost of benefits packages and amending previously collected data as needed." This memo addresses the establishment of the Control Points. I have addressed the benefits portion of the directive in another memo that is attached to the HR Agenda as information for the Committee's consideration

The HR staff worked with the Consultant to re-establish control points by removing the previously collected private sector information and by utilizing public sector data and published survey data-specifically, Towers Watson, Fox Valley Chamber and BLS data. The control points were aged by 1% to reflect the across the board adjustment that was approved for City staff for 2013.

I have attached the previously approved Grade Order Listing along with the corresponding Control Point recommendations for your review. I have also attached the listing of Benchmark positions that was used in the data analysis along with the Market average, public survey and private sector (published source) data for your review. Additionally, I have attached the point ranges for each of the approved grades.

memo

The formula for the establishment of the control points is the mid-point value times the slope (.04041) plus the intercept (\$4.04845) times the aging factor (1.01).

Upon ratification of the Control Points, the employee/management team can begin discussion on the type of pay plan they recommend for the organization that will give the basis for establishment of a final pay plan recommendation for the Council's approval.

The first team meeting is scheduled for June 19, 2013 with a second meeting scheduled July 17, 2013.

If you have any questions regarding the recommendation, please contact me prior to committee.

**CITY OF APPLETON
PROPOSED GRADE ORDER LIST
December 2012**

GRADE	JOB TITLE	DEPARTMENT	FLSA	Control Point
T	CITY ATTORNEY (ELECTED)	Legal Services	E	\$51.01
	DIR COMM & ECONOMIC DEV	Community Development	E	
	FINANCE DIRECTOR	Finance	E	
	HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR	Human Resources	E	
	INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY DIRECTOR	Information Technology	E	
	PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR	DPW	E	
S	DIR PARKS REC FACLTY MGMT	Facilities and Construction	E	\$46.93
	FIRE CHIEF	Fire	E	
	GENERAL MANAGER	Valley Transit	E	
	LIBRARY DIRECTOR	Library	E	
	POLICE CHIEF	Police	E	
	PUBLIC HEALTH OFFICER	Health	E	
	UTILITIES DIRECTOR	Utilities	E	
R	DEPUTY DIR/CITY ENGINEER	DPW	E	\$43.87
Q	VACANT			\$41.83
P	ASST LIBRARY DIRECTOR	Library	E	\$39.78
	CITY ASSESSOR	Community Development	E	
	DEP DIR COMM ECONOMIC DEV	Community Development	E	
	DEPUTY CITY ATTORNEY	Legal Services	E	
	DEPUTY DIR OPERATIONS	DPW	E	
	DEPUTY DIRECTOR FINANCE	Finance	E	
	DEPUTY DIRECTOR HR	Human Resources	E	
	DEPUTY DIRECTOR UTILITIES	Utilities	E	
	DEPUTY FIRE CHIEF	Fire	E	
	DEPUTY POLICE CHIEF	Police	E	
O	ASSIST CITY ATTORNEY II	Legal Services	E	\$37.74
	ASSISTANT CITY ENGINEER	DPW	E	
	ASST GENERAL MANAGER	Valley Transit	E	
	CAPTAIN	Police	E	
	FACILITIES MANAGER	Facilities and Construction	E	
	GROUNDS MANAGER	Facilities and Construction	E	
	TRAFFIC ENGINEER	DPW	E	
N	OPERATIONS FOREMAN - CITY FORESTER	DPW	E	\$35.70
	INSPECTIONS SUPERVISOR	DPW	E	
	NETWORK ADMINISTRATOR	Information Technology	E	
	OPERATIONS FOREMAN - CEA	DPW	E	
	RISK MANAGER	Human Resources	E	
	STAFF DEV/TRAIN COORD-HR	Human Resources	E	
	WATER OPERATIONS SUPERVISOR	Utilities	E	
	WW OPERATIONS SUPERVISOR	Utilities	E	
M	BATTALION CHIEF	Fire	E	\$33.66
	BIOSOLIDS/PRETREAT COORD	Utilities	E	
	CITY CLERK	Legal Services	E	
	ENG TECHNICIAN FOREMAN	DPW	E	
	GOLF COURSE SPECIALIST	Facilities and Construction	E	

**CITY OF APPLETON
PROPOSED GRADE ORDER LIST
December 2012**

GRADE	JOB TITLE	DEPARTMENT	FLSA	Control Point
	LIEUTENANT	Police	E	
	OPERATIONS FOREMAN	DPW	E	
	PARKS PLANNER/LIAISON	Facilities and Construction	E	
	PROFESSIONAL ENGINEER	DPW	E	
	PUBLIC HEALTH NURSE SUPRV	Health	E	
	RECREATION MANAGER	Facilities and Construction	E	
	SPRV ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH	Health	E	
	TECHNICAL SERVICES MGR	Utilities	E	
L	ASSISTANT CITY ATTORNEY I	Legal Services	E	\$31.62
	ASST TRAFFIC ENGINEER	DPW	E	
	CUST SERV ACCT SUPERVISOR	Finance	E	
	ENTERPRISE ACCOUNTING MANAGER	Finance	E	
	FIRE PROTECTION ENGINEER SUPERVISOR	Fire	NE	
	HR GENERALIST	Human Resources	E	
	TRANSIT MAINTENANCE SUPERVISOR	Valley Transit	E	
	TRANSIT OPERATIONS SUPERVISOR	Valley Transit	E	
K	ADMIN SERVICES MANAGER	Police/Valley Transit	E	\$29.58
	ADMINISTRATIVE SERV COOR	Facilities and Construction	E	
	ASSISTANT TO FIRE CHIEF	Fire	E	
	CITY SURVEYOR	DPW	NE	
	ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT SPEC	Community Development	E	
	FISCAL RESOURCES MGR	Police	E	
	INSPECTOR	DPW	NE	
	LEAD ELECTRICIAN	DPW	NE	
	LEAD MECHANIC	DPW	NE	
	LIBRARY SUPERVISOR	Library	E	
	MANAGERIAL ACCT COORD	DPW	E	
	MASTER ELECTRICIAN	DPW, Utilities & Facilities and Construction	NE	
	NETWORK SERVICES SUPRV	Library	E	
	OFFICE MANAGER	DPW	E	
	PARKING UTILITY MANAGER	DPW	E	
	PC APPLICATIONS DEVELOPER	Information Technology	E	
	PLUMBER	Facilities and Construction	NE	
	PRINCIPAL PLANNER III	Community Development	E	
	PROPERTY ASSESSOR III	Community Development	NE	
	PURCHASING MANAGER	Finance	E	
	RECREATION PROGRAMMER	Facilities and Construction	E	
J	BUDGET ANALYST	Finance	E	\$27.54
	BUSINESS MANAGER	Library	E	
	CIVIL ENGINEER	DPW	E	
	COMMUNITY RELATIONS SPEC	Valley Transit	E	
	DEPUTY CITY CLERK	Legal Services	E	
	HOUSING COORDINATOR	Community Development	E	
	INSTRUMENTATION TECH	Utilities	NE	
	PH PREPAREDNESS COORD	Health	E	
	PRINCIPAL PLANNER II	Community Development	E	
	PUBLIC HEALTH NURSE	Health	E	
	SYSTEMS ANALYST	Information Technology	E	

**CITY OF APPLETON
PROPOSED GRADE ORDER LIST
December 2012**

GRADE	JOB TITLE	DEPARTMENT	FLSA	Control Point		
I	ADMIN ASST - POLICE CHIEF	Police	NE	\$25.50		
	ASSET MANAGEMENT PURCHASING SPEC	Utilities	NE			
	BENEFITS COORDINATOR	Human Resources	NE			
	CARPENTER/PAINTER	Facilities and Construction	NE			
	CITY SEALER	Health	E			
	CIVILIAN FIRE INSPECTOR	Fire	NE			
	COMM DEV SPECIALIST	Community Development	NE			
	DIVERSITY COORDINATOR	Community Development	NE			
	ENGINEERING SPECIALIST	DPW	NE			
	ENVIRONMENTALIST II	Health	E			
	FACILITIES CONTROLS TECH	Facilities and Construction	NE			
	GIS SPECIALIST	Community Development	E			
	HORTICULTURIST	DPW	NE			
	HVAC TECHNICIAN	Facilities and Construction	NE			
	LEGAL ASSISTANT	Legal Services	NE			
	LIBRARIAN	Library	E			
	LIBRARY ASST SUPERVISOR	Library	E			
	MAINTENANCE SPECIALIST II	Utilities	NE			
	MASTER MECHANIC	DPW	NE			
	PC/LAN SPECIALIST	Information Technology	NE			
	PROPERTY ASSESSOR II	Community Development	NE			
	PURCHASING CLERK	DPW	NE			
	SECRETARY TO THE MAYOR	Mayor	NE			
	H	ARBORIST	DPW		NE	\$23.46
		ASSESSMENT TECHNICIAN	DPW		NE	
ELECTIONS CLERK		Legal Services	NE			
ENGINEERING TECHNICIAN		DPW	NE			
EROSION CONTROL INSPECTOR		DPW	NE			
FACILITIES TECHNICIAN		Facilities and Construction	NE			
GROUPS TECHNICIAN		Facilities and Construction	NE			
HELP DESK ANALYST		Information Technology	NE			
LIBRARY ASSISTANT		Library	NE			
LIQUIDS OPERATOR		Utilities	NE			
MARKETING ASSISTANT		Library	NE			
NETWORK SERVICES ASSISTANT		Library	NE			
PAYROLL COORDINATOR		Finance	NE			
PERSONAL PROPERTY ASSESSMENT TECH		Community Development	NE			
PLANS & RECORDS SPEC		Facilities and Construction, DPW	NE			
PROPERTY TAX SPECIALIST		Finance	NE			
RELIEF OPER/MAINT HELPER		Utilities	NE			
SOLIDS OPERATOR		Utilities	NE			
UTILITY WORKER		Utilities	NE			
WATER PLANT OPERATOR		Utilities	NE			
G		ACCOUNT CLERK III	Finance	NE	\$21.42	
		ADMIN SUPPORT SPECIALIST	HR, Police, Legal Services, Utilities & DPW	NE		
	FACILITIES WORKER	Facilities and Construction	NE			
	5TH FLOOR CUSTOMER SERV	DPW	NE			
	LABORATORY TECHNICIAN	Utilities	NE			
	LEAD CSO	Police	NE			
OPERATOR II	DPW	NE				

**CITY OF APPLETON
PROPOSED GRADE ORDER LIST
December 2012**

GRADE	JOB TITLE	DEPARTMENT	FLSA	Control Point
	REAL ESTATE ASSMT TECH	Community Development	NE	
	UTILITY CLERK	Finance	NE	
	WEIGHTS & MEASURES SPEC	Health	NE	
F	ACCOUNT CLERK II	Finance	NE	\$19.38
	ADMIN ASSISTANT	Police, Facilities & Construction, Fire, Health, Libr.	NE	
	COMMUNICATION TECHNICIAN	Police	NE	
	GROUNDS COORDINATOR	Facilities and Construction	NE	
	INVENTORY CONTROL CLERK	DPW	NE	
	OPERATOR I	DPW	NE	
	SERVICEMAN II	DPW	NE	
	UTILITY LOCATOR	DPW	NE	
E	ACCOUNT CLERK I	Finance	NE	\$17.84
	LABORER	DPW	NE	
	SERVICE PERSON	DPW	NE	
D	LIBRARY CLERK	Library	NE	\$16.82
	OPERATIONS CLERK	Library	NE	
	PARKNG ENFORCEMENT PERSON	DPW	NE	
C	BINDERY CLERK	Library	NE	\$15.80
	LIBRARY PAGE CLERK	Library	NE	
B	PARKING RAMP ATTENDANT	DPW	NE	\$14.78

CITY OF APPLETON
BENCHMARK RATES WITH MARKET ESTIMATES
June 6, 2013

JOB CODE	JOB TITLE	JOB EVAL POINTS	MARKET ESTIMATES	PUBLIC SURVEY DATA	PRIVATE SECTOR DATA
819	PARKNG ENFORCEMENT PERSON	314	\$16.54	\$16.54	
409	LIBRARY CLERK	317	\$15.44	\$15.44	
824	LABORER NEW HIRE >10/2011	331	\$16.68	\$19.85	\$15.63
613	ACCOUNT CLERK I	334	\$16.09	\$16.55	\$15.94
611	ACCOUNT CLERK II	374	\$16.59	\$18.68	\$15.90
1110	COMMUNICATION TECHNICIAN	374	\$21.44	\$21.44	
1111	SUPPORT SERV ADMIN ASST	374	\$16.76	\$17.70	\$16.45
823	OPERATOR I	386	\$19.44	\$21.15	\$18.87
915	FACILITIES WORKER	411	\$20.59	\$21.49	\$20.29
1313	LABORATORY TECHNICIAN	421	\$21.28	\$24.50	\$20.20
307	HR RECRUITMENT ASSISTANT	423	\$19.67	\$19.58	\$19.70
826	OPERATOR II	433	\$21.95	\$21.95	
817	5TH FLOOR CUSTOMER SERV	437	\$17.04	\$17.42	\$16.91
1108	ADMIN SUPPORT ASSISTANT	441	\$17.27	\$17.27	
851	OPERATOR II	465	\$22.69	\$22.69	
810	ENGINEERING TECHNICIAN II	465	\$23.09	\$23.09	
1216	HELP DESK ANALYST - TS	476	\$23.58	\$24.46	\$23.29
1312	LIQUIDS OPERATOR	476	\$22.64	\$23.10	\$22.49
1306	WATER PLANT OPERATOR	476	\$22.97	\$24.43	\$22.49
706	PRSNAL PRPTY ASSMNT TECH	482	\$24.02	\$24.28	\$23.93
607	ACCOUNT CLERK III	493	\$21.47	\$26.05	\$19.94
830	PURCHASING CLERK	509	\$23.41	\$25.14	\$21.68
1311	MAINTENANCE SPECIALIST II	511	\$25.73	\$25.73	
913	HVAC TECHNICIAN	522	\$25.52	\$24.80	\$26.24
405	LIBRARIAN	522	\$24.09	\$26.21	\$21.97
1105	ADMIN ASST - POLICE CHIEF	528	\$25.74	\$25.46	\$26.02
705	PROPERTY ASSESSOR II	536	\$27.50	\$27.50	
808	ENGINEERING TECHNICIAN V	537	\$25.53	\$25.61	\$25.45
914	CARPENTER/PAINTER	539	\$23.67	\$25.10	\$22.25
855	MASTER MECHANIC	539	\$21.66	\$22.78	\$20.55
205	ENVIRONMENTALIST II	544	\$26.97	\$26.97	
204	PUBLIC HEALTH NURSE	558	\$28.32	\$28.42	\$28.22
708	PRINCIPAL PLANNER II	577	\$29.32	\$29.32	
404	BUSINESS MANAGER	579	\$31.99	\$31.99	
1214	PROGRAMMER/ANALYST III TS	583	\$30.24	\$31.29	\$29.19
602	DEPUTY CITY CLERK	595	\$23.38	\$23.38	
1309	INSTRUMENTATION TECH	595	\$26.13	\$26.13	
1103	FISCAL RESOURCES MGR	619	\$33.54	\$33.54	
911	PLUMBER	622	\$31.07		\$31.07
606	PURCHASING MANAGER - FIN	622	\$37.51	\$33.38	\$41.63
403	LIBRARY SUPERVISOR	634	\$28.52	\$28.52	
820	INSPECTOR	646	\$29.15	\$29.24	\$29.07
909	MASTER ELECTRICIAN	649	\$27.85	\$28.29	\$27.41
614	ENTERPRISE ACCOUNTING MGR	651	\$35.06	\$31.16	\$38.95
1403	TRANSIT OPERATIONS SUPERV	678	\$31.38	\$25.99	\$36.78

CITY OF APPLETON
BENCHMARK RATES WITH MARKET ESTIMATES
June 6, 2013

JOB CODE	JOB TITLE	JOB EVAL POINTS	MARKET ESTIMATES	PUBLIC SURVEY DATA	PRIVATE SECTOR DATA
1112	LIEUTENANT	708	\$36.30	\$36.30	
202	PUBLIC HEALTH NURSE SUPRV	720	\$36.49	\$36.49	
804	CIVIL ENGINEER III	728	\$36.40	\$36.26	\$36.84
905	SUPERINTENDENT PKS & REC	746	\$33.56	\$33.56	
103	BATTALION CHIEF	748	\$41.13	\$41.13	
617	CITY CLERK	749	\$33.77	\$33.77	
304	RISK MANAGER	759	\$34.12	\$33.92	\$34.72
1307	WW OPERATIONS SUPERVISOR	761	\$36.96	\$36.96	
1303	WATER OPERATIONS SUPERV	761	\$35.57	\$35.57	
1213	NETWORK ADMINISTRATOR -TS	770	\$32.41	\$33.39	\$29.48
1109	CAPTAIN	817	\$39.20	\$39.20	
503	ASSIST CITY ATTORNEY II	822	\$37.34	\$37.32	\$37.41
907	FACILITIES MANAGER	824	\$35.76	\$35.30	\$37.14
703	CITY ASSESSOR	880	\$41.36	\$41.36	
615	DEPUTY DIRECTOR FINANCE	880	\$39.06	\$37.64	\$43.30
1102	DEPUTY POLICE CHIEF	886	\$42.37	\$42.37	
802	DEPUTY DIR/CITY ENGINEER	975	\$45.39	\$45.39	
1401	GENERAL MANAGER - VT	1030	\$40.64	\$40.64	
901	DIR PARKS REC FACLTY MGMT	1030	\$42.82	\$42.82	
401	LIBRARY DIRECTOR	1030	\$42.15	\$42.15	
101	FIRE CHIEF	1041	\$49.07	\$49.07	
1101	POLICE CHIEF	1041	\$47.24	\$47.24	
701	DIR COMM & ECONOMIC DEV	1114	\$43.01	\$43.01	
601	FINANCE DIRECTOR	1117	\$51.50	\$49.28	\$58.16
301	HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR	1117	\$47.98	\$45.89	\$54.24
1220	INFORMATION SYSTEMS DIRECTOR	1117	\$45.47	\$43.22	\$52.23
801	PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR	1198	\$52.02	\$52.02	

REGRESSION RESULTS	SLOPE	\$0.04041
	Y-INTERCEPT	\$4.04845

NOTES:

Survey data collected in 2012 and aged + 1% to reflect wage increases granted by City for 2013.

Public sector survey is weighted

- 75% for benchmarks above 700 points,
- 50% for benchmarks between 500 and 699 points, and
- 25% for benchmarks below 500 points

Private sector estimate is the average of survey data published BLS, Fox Valley Chamber Survey & Towers Watson.

CITY OF APPLETON, WI
 PAY PLAN CONTROL POINTS
 June 6, 2013

Grade	POINT RANGE			Control Point
	Start	Mid	End	
T	1100	1149.5	1199	\$51.01
S	1000	1049.5	1099	\$46.93
R	950	974.5	999	\$43.87
Q	900	924.5	949	\$41.83
P	850	874.5	899	\$39.78
O	800	824.5	849	\$37.74
N	750	774.5	799	\$35.70
M	700	724.5	749	\$33.66
L	650	674.5	699	\$31.62
K	600	624.5	649	\$29.58
J	550	574.5	599	\$27.54
I	500	524.5	549	\$25.50
H	450	474.5	499	\$23.46
G	400	424.5	449	\$21.42
F	350	374.5	399	\$19.38
E	325	337	349	\$17.84
D	300	312	324	\$16.82
C	275	287	299	\$15.80
B	250	262	274	\$14.78

SLOPE	\$0.04041
Y-INTERCEPT	\$4.04845

Note: Regression equation based on 2012 data, so Control Points "aged" additional 1% to adjust for City 2013 general pay increase and market change.