



“...meeting community needs...enhancing quality of life.”

**PARKS, RECREATION & FACILITIES
MANAGEMENT**

Dean R. Gazza, Director

1819 East Witzke Boulevard
Appleton, Wisconsin 54911-8401
(920) 832-5572 FAX (920) 993-3103
Email - dean.gazza@appleton.org

TO: Finance Committee

FROM: Dean R. Gazza, Director, Parks Recreation and Facilities Management

DATE: 1/8/2024

RE: Action Item: Award the Engineering Contract for the AWWTP MCC Replacement Project Phase 1 to Donohue and Associates in the amount of \$159,420 for data collection and bidding documents along with \$124,719 for bidding and construction oversight services upon approval of funding in the 2025 budget as this is a multiyear project, for a total contract amount of \$284,139.

Action: Approve budget transfer of \$60,000 from the “AWWTP Electrical Distribution Project” to “2023 AWWTP MCC Replacement Project.”

PROJECT

The 2023 Capital Improvement Budget allocated \$100,000 to complete engineering services needed for the first phase of a five-phase project to replace all of the electrical Motor Control Center’s (MCC’s) at the Appleton Wastewater Treatment Plant (AWWTP) complex over the next 15 years.

BACKGROUND

Appleton Wastewater Treatment Plant Building has numerous MCCs throughout the plant. Since the original construction of the AWWTP, there have been several additions to the plant including large upgrades in the 1970s and 1990s. The majority of the MCCs at the AWWTP were installed as part of these upgrades and have reached, or are nearing, the end of their useful service life. In 2022 Donohue and Associates completed a conditions assessment report for all the MCC’s at AWWTP. The report laid out a replacement plan that includes five phases of replacement. The City will proceed with replacement of MCCs identified in the Phase 1 replacement recommendation detailed in the June 2022 Condition Assessment report.

RFP PROCESS:

The request for proposal was distributed to four engineering firms. Representatives from three of the four firms attended a pre-proposal meeting where the project was defined along with the project scope. One of the firms, Steinmetz Engineering, opted not to provide a proposal based on the specifics of this project. The proposals were reviewed and scored by PRFMD and AWWTP prior to the opening of the bid tabulation document. The following table identifies the engineering firms along with their proposal score and proposal pricing:

Table 1: Engineering Firms and RFQ Results

Firm:	TOTAL PTS	BID TOTAL	Value (Point/\$)
Donohue	1245	\$284,139	44
McMahon	1245	\$310,988	40
Terra	510	481,185	11
Steinmetz - DNP	NA	NA	NA

*DNP = Did Not Propose

*NA – Not Applicable

The evaluation team completed their review and scoring of the submitted proposals. The evaluation team found that Donohue had scored the highest (tie) and provided a proposal that best meets the City’s needs. The team also found that the McMahon firm had provided a competitive proposal. The evaluation team completed the value evaluation to assess whether or not the additional costs for the McMahon proposal were worth justifying. The formula produced results that Donohue provided the best overall project value including costs.

The Donohue team has extensive experience with similar AWWTP projects. Their proposal demonstrated a comprehensive approach that delivered construction and improvement alternatives that will best fit the City’s needs.

BUDGET TRANSFER

We are requesting a \$60,000 budget transfer from the AWWTP Electrical Distribution Project. The AWWTP Electrical Distribution Project is currently underbudget and is expected to be completed in the next month without any issues.

RECOMMENDATION

Award the Engineering Contract for the AWWTP MCC Replacement Project Phase 1 to Donohue and Associates in the amount of \$159,420 for data collection and bidding documents along with approval to issue a contract amendment of \$124,719 for bidding and construction oversight services upon approval of future funding during the next budget cycle as this is a multiyear project.

Please contact me at 832-5572 or at dean.gazza@appleton.org with any questions.