



DEPARTMENT OF
UTILITIES

Department of Utilities
Wastewater Treatment Plant
2006 East Newberry Street
Appleton, WI 54915
p: 920-832-5945
f: 920-832-5949

www.appleton.org/government/utilities

MEMORANDUM

Date: July 16, 2024
To: Chairperson Vered Meltzer
CC: Ryan Rice, Utilities Deputy Director
From: Chris Stempa, Utilities Director
Subject: **Action: Reject base bid from August Winter & Sons in the amount of \$2,617,900 for the Appleton Wastewater Treatment Plant Primary Clarifier #1-#4 Rehabilitation Project**

BACKGROUND:

There are six primary clarifiers at the Appleton Wastewater Treatment Plant (AWWTP). Primary Clarifiers #1 and #2 were originally constructed in 1936 with Primary Clarifiers #3 and #4 later constructed as part of a 1961 expansion project. The last major maintenance or CIP project completed on Primary Clarifiers #1 through #4 was in 2001. As part of that project, all four primary clarifiers were modified to raise the bridge elevations and install new drive mechanisms.

A rehabilitation project was formulated based on the findings of a conditions assessment. The project that was to be carried forward would restore the original concrete grout layer which has deteriorated over the 60 plus years of continuous use and address steel coating system deterioration of major clarifier operating components.

BIDS:

On Wednesday, June 24, 2024, the City opened and reviewed the bids from two contractors which are summarized in Table 1 below. Each bid met the submittal requirements.

Table 1: Bid Tab Summary

Item	August Winter and Sons, Inc	Rohde Brothers
Base Bid	\$2,617,900	\$3,325,000

August Winter and Sons, Inc provided the least cost base bid but their base bid exceeded the available budget by over \$1,000,000. There were two primary factors that contributed to the higher bid costs. First and foremost was the expanded base bid scope which included new stainless steel scum baffles and scum beaches/troughs, cure-in-place pipe lining of the Primary #1 and #2 sludge suction pipe, and replacement primary sludge pump. These additional scope items were added late in the preliminary design process knowing there was available unused funding from other construction projects that could be recaptured. Unfortunately, the preliminary cost estimates fell well short of what bidding process revealed. Second, was the timing of the bid processes. The late June bid date was not advantageous from a contractors perspective because of a compressed schedule that would have been required subsequent to contract execution to complete core scope tasks (e.g. coating and grouting) within a limited warm weather window. The substantial completion date was extended into mid-2025 to account for this but it did not provide the level of bid cost relief that would have been needed to advance this contract.

After conferring internally and with our consulting engineer, the Utilities Department is recommending rejecting the bid. All the current project bidding documents will be deferred to a future year. That delay will not jeopardize existing clarifier operations or treatment efficiencies. The intent would be to rebudget accordingly based on the expanded scope of work that will address all long-term needs within this area of treatment.

RECOMMENDATION:

I am recommending the rejection of the base bid from August Winter and Sons in the amount of \$2,617,900 for the Appleton Wastewater Treatment Plant Primary Clarifier #1-#4 Rehabilitation Project.

If you have any questions or require additional information regarding this project, please contact Chris Stempa at 920-832-5945.