



"...meeting community needs...enhancing quality of life."

**PARKS, RECREATION & FACILITIES  
MANAGEMENT**

**Dean R. Gazza, Director**

1819 East Witzke Boulevard  
Appleton, Wisconsin 54911-8401  
(920) 832-5572 FAX (920) 993-3103  
Email - [dean.gazza@appleton.org](mailto:dean.gazza@appleton.org)

TO: Finance Committee

FROM: Dean R. Gazza, Director, Parks Recreation and Facilities Management

DATE: 1/8/2024

RE: Action Item: Award the Engineering Contract for the 2023 AWWTP L-Building HVAC Replacement Project to McMahon in the amount of \$156,898 plus a 5% contingency for a total not to exceed project engineering cost of \$164,743.

**PROJECT**

The 2024 Capital Improvement Budget has allocated \$2,490,000 to complete HVAC upgrades at the AWWTP L-Building. Within the project budget, \$175,000 has been allocated for engineering work that is needed to complete the project.

**BACKGROUND**

Appleton Wastewater Treatment Plant Building L was constructed in 1976 with a ventilation system consisting of six air handling units with hot water heat, providing 100% outside air. The two main units serving the Sludge Thickening Room provide a total airflow of 28,800 cubic feet per minute (CFM), and the Chemical rooms on the first floor are served by four other units with a total airflow of 11,000 CFM. The selected consultant will design a project for the replacement of four of the six units, serving approximately 9,500sf. With these replacements the City of Appleton has budgeted for the installation of an air-to-air heat recovery system serving the Sludge Thickening Room, enclosure of the process tanks with localized exhaust, and passive intake louvers for summer ventilation.

**RFP PROCESS:**

The request for proposal was distributed to three engineering firms. Representatives from two of the three firms attended a pre-proposal meeting where the project was defined along with the project scope. One of the firms, MSA, opted not to provide a proposal based on the specifics of this project. The proposals were reviewed and scored by PRFMD and AWWTP staff prior to the opening of the bid tabulation document. The following table identifies the engineering firms along with their proposal score and proposal pricing:

**Table 1: Engineering Firms and RFQ Results**

| <b>Firm:</b> | <b>TOTAL<br/>PTS</b> | <b>BID TOTAL</b> | <b>Value<br/>(Point/\$)</b> |
|--------------|----------------------|------------------|-----------------------------|
| McMahon      | <b>695</b>           | <b>\$156,898</b> | <b>44</b>                   |
| Donohue      | 505                  | \$159,979        | 32                          |
| MSA - DNP    | NA                   | NA               | NA                          |

\*DNP = Did Not Propose

\*NA – Not Applicable

The evaluation team completed their review and scoring of the submitted proposals. The evaluation team found that McMahon had scored the highest and provided a proposal that best meets the City’s needs. The team also found that the Donohue firm had provided a competitive proposal. The evaluation team completed the value evaluation to assess whether or not the additional costs for the Donohue proposal were worth justifying. The formula produced results that McMahon provided the best overall project value including costs.

The McMahon team has extensive experience with similar AWWTP projects. Their proposal demonstrated a comprehensive approach that delivered construction and improvement alternatives that will best fit the City’s needs.

**RECOMMENDATION**

Award the Engineering Contract for the 2023 AWWTP L-Building HVAC Replacement Project to McMahon in the amount of \$156,898 plus a 5% contingency for a total not to exceed a project engineering cost of \$164,743.

Please contact me at 832-5572 or at [dean.gazza@appleton.org](mailto:dean.gazza@appleton.org) with any questions.