



"...meeting community needs...enhancing quality of life."

Department of Utilities
Water Treatment Facility
2281 Manitowoc Rd.
Menasha, WI 54952
920-997-4200 tel.
920-997-3240 fax

TO: Chairperson Greg Dannecker and Members of the Utilities Committee

FROM: Chris Shaw, Utilities Director

DATE: April 4, 2017

RE: *Award Engineering Services Contract for the North Reservoir Project to McMAHON Associates, Inc., in the amount of \$34,871 with a 10% contingency of \$3,487 for a project total not to exceed \$38,358*

BACKGROUND:

The Appleton Water Utility includes the North Reservoir. This reservoir was constructed in 2000. The capacity of the reservoir is 3 million gallons. To date, the tank has had little maintenance other than scheduled cleanings and inspections. During the 2012 regulatory inspection it was noted that a number of maintenance items need to be attended to preserve this asset. To prevent the spread of corrosion, the report also included a recommendation to have the tank painted.

Professional Services proposals were solicited from four engineering firms. The firms were selected for the following reasons: McMahan and Associates were the original design engineers of the North Reservoir. Robert E Lee and Associates were identified as a firm with successful coatings projects including the AWTF Softener Recoating Project. Strand and Associates were the successful engineering firm for the Glendale Tower Project. Donohue and Associates were identified due to their successful digester projects that included pipe and tank coating tasks.

An evaluation team completed their review of three proposals (Donohue did not submit) and scored according to the results in the table below. Of the submitted proposals, the evaluation team found that Robert E Lee had scored the highest and provided a proposal that best met the City's needs. The team also found that the McMAHON firm had provided a competitive proposal. The evaluation team completed the value evaluation to provide whether or not the additional costs for the Robert E Lee proposal were worth justifying. The formula produced results that McMAHON provided the best overall project value. In addition, McMahan and Associates has performed a number of coatings projects in the past with successful results.

COMPANY	QUOTE	SCORE	VALUE
McMAHON Associates, Inc.	\$34,871	151	\$231
Robert E Lee and Associates, Inc.	\$85,375	191	\$447
Strand Associates	60,800	104	\$585
Donohue and Associates	N/A	DNP	N/A

*DNP – Did Not Propose

RECOMMENDATION:

I recommend awarding the Engineering Services Contract for the North Reservoir Project to McMAHON Associates, Inc., in the amount of \$34,871 with a 10% contingency of \$3,487 for a project total not to exceed \$38,358. The 2017 water operations budget includes \$675,000 for professional services and a contractor to complete the maintenance activities listed previously.

If you have any questions regarding this project please contact me, Chris Shaw, at ph: 832-5945.