



"...meeting community needs...enhancing quality of life."

Department of Utilities
Wastewater Treatment Plant
2006 E Newberry Street
Appleton, WI 54915
920-832-5945 tel.
920-832-5949 fax

TO: Chairperson Vered Meltzer and Members of the Utilities Committee

FROM: Chris Stempa, Utilities Deputy Director

DATE: April 18, 2019

RE: *Award the 2019 AWWTP Improvements Project Engineering Phase to McMahon in the amount of \$169,886 with a 10% contingency of \$16,989 for a Project Total not to exceed \$186,875*

BACKGROUND:

Appleton Wastewater Treatment Plant (AWWTP) has five projects identified in the 2019 budget that involve the rehabilitation, replacement, or improvements to address immediate needs and long term reliability. The project includes Return Activated Sludge (RAS) pump replacement, piping modifications (e.g. blended sludge, waste gas, and filtrate), primary clarifier concrete recoating, and outside secondary containment (chemical offload) repairs.

RFP PROCESS

Request for Proposals (RFPs) were submitted to three engineering firms for professional services. Each of the firms were selected based on an extensive resume of wastewater industry work and past successful project work at the AWWTP.

The Utility organized an evaluation team to critically review each firm's written proposal based on established weighted criteria described in the RFP. Each proposal was given a score by team members based on content and independent of costs. Sealed fees were revealed following the tally of each team member scores. The table below summarizes the proposal review team's tallied scores, engineering firm's proposed fee, and the calculated value score which incorporates the proposed fee to determine the best overall proposal. The higher the final value score, the greater the value of the proposal.

RFP Evaluation Results

COMPANY	SCORE	QUOTE	VALUE
Donohue and Associates	186	\$177,840	105
McMAHON Associates, Inc.	188	\$169,886	111
Strand Associates	130	\$203,700	64

Notes

1. "Total Score" represents the combined total from each of the three evaluation team members.
2. Point Value Factor Method = (Qualitative Proposal Score/ Quote Price) x 100,000. The highest point value factor derived is considered the best value proposal.

The McMahon Associates, Inc. (McMahon) proposal received the highest overall evaluation score by the review team and provided the greatest overall value using the point value calculation. The McMahon project team proposal demonstrated a comprehensive understanding of project needs and an approach to deliver a successful project.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approval of an Engineering contract for 2019 AWWTP Improvements Project to McMahon in the amount of \$169,886 with a 10% contingency of \$16,989 for a Project Total not to exceed \$186,875.

If you have any questions or require additional information regarding this project please contact Chris Stempa at 920-832-5945.