

## Department of Public Works – Engineering Division

### MEMO

**TO:** Utilities Committee

**FROM:** Paula Vandehey, Director of Public Works  
Pete Neuberger, Staff Engineer  
Sue Olson, Staff Engineer

**DATE:** January 7, 2020

**RE:** Award 2020D Stormwater Consulting Services Contract for the City-wide Stormwater Management Plan Update to Brown and Caldwell in an amount not to exceed \$199,981.

---

The Department of Public Works is requesting approval of the 2020D stormwater consulting services contract with Brown and Caldwell for the City-wide Stormwater Management Plan Update in an amount not to exceed \$199,981. After this contract, \$493,269 will remain in the 2020 stormwater consulting services budget.

The last City-wide Stormwater Management Plan was completed in 2014. Part of that plan included benchmarks for making yearly progress toward achieving water quality goals, including updating this plan in 2020-2021. On May 1, 2019, the WDNR issued a new stormwater permit, which also requires the City to update this plan. In anticipation of this effort, the City applied for and received a WDNR Urban NPS Planning Grant for \$75,000 for this project.

The scope of work for this contract includes:

- Preparing or updating the water quality models (WinSLAMM) for older City ponds
- Updating City-wide modeling for “no controls”, existing conditions, street cleaning, grass swales and new regional stormwater ponds
- Adding reachsheds in the Upper Fox/Wolf TMDL
- Evaluating potential water quality practices to assist the City in meeting TMDL goals
- Preparing cost estimates for the various alternatives
- Preparing a short term and long term implementation plan
- Meeting with various City departments, adjacent communities, and other stakeholders such as the Appleton Area School District and Business/Builders Associations
- Preparing a report and grant deliverables

In October 2019, DPW solicited proposals from three engineering firms and received proposals from all three of them. Proposals were rated on a 100-point scale on the following criteria: Relevant Experience, Project Team, Project Understanding and Approach, and Schedule. Technical

Proposals were evaluated by a City review team consisting of Ross Buetow, City Engineer; Pete Neuberger, Staff Engineer; and Sue Olson, Staff Engineer. The ranking below is based on the technical scores.

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Firm</u>	<u>Score</u>	<u>Price</u>	<u>Price/Point</u>
1.	Brown and Caldwell	95.33	\$196,781	\$2,064
2.	McMahon	91.00	\$194,429	\$2,137
3.	Strand	84.67	\$177,200	\$2,093

Based on the Technical scores, staff felt that any of the three consultants could perform the necessary work and meet City and grant schedules. Brown and Caldwell stood out for the following reasons:

- Relevant experience in the Lower Fox TMDL as well as statewide and nationwide experience
- Understanding of the City staffing structure and DPW Operations
- Higher percentage of Professional Engineer hours
- Strongest communication plan during the life of the project
- Close relationship with key personnel at the WDNR and other regulatory agencies

Due to the Urban NPS Planning Grant requirements, this contract was sent to WDNR for approval in December 2019. The City received the approval letter for the scope of services on January 6, 2020. Based on a new requirement in the grant contract and potential changes in WDNR guidance and technical options, both unknown at the time of the RFP, staff requested additional work by the consultant, slightly increasing the cost (\$3,200). This would have been added to any of the proposals. Based on the high technical score and lowest cost per point, staff is recommending Brown and Caldwell for this project.