



"...meeting community needs...enhancing quality of life."

Department of Utilities
Wastewater Treatment Plant
2006 East Newberry Street
Appleton, Wisconsin 54915 – 2758
920 – 832 – 5945 tel.
920 – 832 – 5949 fax

To: Chairman Greg Dannecker and Members of the Utilities Committee

From: Chris Stempa, Utilities Deputy Director

cc: Chris Shaw, Utilities Director

Date: May 21, 2015

Re: *Approval of an Engineering contract for the Midway Road and Scarlet Oak Lift Station Improvements Projects to McMahon in the amount of \$34,864 plus a 15% contingency of \$5,230 for a total cost of \$40,094*

BACKGROUND:

The capital improvements projects (CIP) which were formulated as part of the 2015 budget process to address reliability issues and long-term site specific needs with the Midway Lift Station and Scarlet Oak Lift Station. For reasons of economy these projects are being bundled with a single contract for engineering services. A description of each lift station project site is found below.

Midway Lift Station: The Midway Road Lift Station is located between the 1200 and 1300 block of Midway Road within the City of Appleton. Constructed in the early 1990's, it remains the fifth largest raw sewage lift station system in the Appleton Sewer Service Area and is the only one of these five that is not equipped with permanent on-site secondary power generation capabilities. Midway Road Lift Station has lost power during severe storm events as recently as 2012 and 2013 when a portable generator was deployed to provide power to pumps and ancillary supporting equipment. Coordinated efforts by Utility staff to deploy back-up power generation maintained continuity of service to the surrounding commercial and residential customers.

On-site emergency standby power at Midway Road Lift Station will greatly improve system dependability and lessen the demand on existing portable power generation equipment and the personnel needed to connect and maintain it. This upgrade will provide customers significantly improved protection from sewer back-ups during emergencies where portable units and staff resources would otherwise need to be deployed.

Scarlet Oak Lift Station: The Scarlet Oak Lift Station is located on the east side of the 3300 block of South Scarlet Oak Lane and was originally constructed in 1995. Escalating occurrences of electrical system failure, sewage pump blockages, and various wetwell

component deterioration increases the potential for sanitary sewer bypasses and basement backups.

New pumps with improved impeller design will reduce the frequency of clogging. Replacement of the pump rail system is necessary due to deterioration. Wholesale change out of the electrical system will restore station reliability and compliance with current electrical codes. Improvements to site access (currently grass) will provide reliable unimpeded vehicular entry to lift station equipment during emergency situations as well as periodic maintenance events. This project will likely require professional engineering services to prepare bidding documents. This project will require Wisconsin Department of Natural Resources authorization.

RFP PROCESS:

The request for proposal was distributed to four engineering firms. Representatives from each firm attended a pre-proposal meeting that defined the project, scope, and held a question and answer session. A site tour was held to orient the engineering firms to the project location. The following table identifies the engineering firms along with their proposal score and proposal pricing:

Company	Total Score ⁽¹⁾	Quote Pricing	Points Value Factor	Final Ranking
Applied Technologies	179	\$36,200	5	2
Donohue	220	\$72,095	3	3
McMahon	248	\$34,864	7	1
Robert E. Lee & Associates, Inc.	103	\$45,700	2	4

Notes:

1. "Total Score" represents the combined total from each of the three evaluation team members.
2. Point Value Factor Method = (Qualitative Proposal Score/ Quote Price) x 1,000. The highest point value factor derived is considered the best value proposal.

An evaluation team completed their review of the submitted proposals. Firm proposals were evaluated and scored. The evaluation team found that McMahon had provided a proposal that best met the City's needs. The McMahon project team is experienced with municipal lift stations of similar size and complexity. Their proposal demonstrated a comprehensive approach that delivered construction or improvement alternatives that address current lift station needs and deficiencies.

RECOMMENDATION:

Approval of an Engineering contract for the Midway Road and Scarlet Oak Lift Station Improvements Projects to McMahon in the amount of \$34,864 plus a 15% contingency of \$5,230 for a total cost of \$40,094.

If you have any questions or require additional information regarding this project please contact Chris Stempa at 920-832-5945.