



“...meeting community needs...enhancing quality of life.”

Department of Utilities
Water Treatment Facility
2281 Manitowoc Rd.
Menasha, WI 54952
920-997-4200 tel.
920-997-3240 fax

TO: Chairperson and Members of the Utilities Committee

FROM: Chris Shaw, Utilities Director

DATE: July 31, 2023

RE: *Award Engineering Services Contract for the AWTF Clearwells and Lindbergh Standpipe Project to McMAHON Associates, Inc., in the amount of \$39,100 with a 10% contingency of \$3,910 for a project total not to exceed \$40,010*

BACKGROUND:

The Appleton Water Utility includes a North and South Clearwell with a capacity of 5.2 million gallons. Additionally, the utility includes a 2.0-million-gallon Lindbergh Standpipe. All three of these tanks are required by WDNR to be taken out of service, cleaned, inspected, and to have necessary maintenance performed. The Lindbergh Standpipe had a coatings project in 2019 and minor maintenance items will need to be attended to. The two clearwells have maintenance and improvements that has been estimated to be approximately \$350,000. For the project to move forward, an engineering firm is necessary to perform the regulatory inspection and identify the construction work in the form of bidding documents.

Invitations for professional services proposals were sent to three engineering firms. The firms were selected for their project familiarity and project team members that had a history of similar water industry project work. AECOM was initially interested but did not propose.

An evaluation team completed the review of the two proposals and scored according to the results in the table. Of the submitted proposals, the evaluation team found that Strand Associates had scored the highest and provided a proposal that met the City's needs. McMAHON provided a lesser score but did propose a least cost. The evaluation team completed the value evaluation to provide whether the additional costs for the Strand Associates proposal were worth justifying. The formula produced results that McMAHON provided the best overall project value. In addition, McMAHON had been the original engineer for the AWTF North and South Clearwells.

COMPANY	QUOTE	SCORE	VALUE	RANK
McMAHON Associates	\$39,100	84	\$465/pt	1
Strand Associates	\$89,710	96	\$935/pt	2
AECOM	DNP	NA	N/A	N/A

*DNP – Did Not Propose

RECOMMENDATION:

I recommend awarding an Engineering Services Contract for the AWTF Clearwells and Lindbergh Standpipe Project to McMAHON in the amount of \$39,100 with a 10% contingency of \$3,910 for a project total not to exceed \$43,010.

If you have any questions regarding this project please contact me, Chris Shaw, at ph: 832-5945.