



"...meeting community needs...enhancing quality of life."

Department of Utilities
Wastewater Treatment Plant
2006 East Newberry Street
Appleton, Wisconsin 54915 – 2758
920 – 832 – 5945 tel.
920 – 832 – 5949 fax

To: Chairman Greg Dannecker and Members of the Utilities Committee

From: Chris Stempa, Utilities Deputy Director

cc: Chris Shaw, Utilities Director

Date: March 8, 2018

Re: *Approval of an Engineering contract for the Compost Facility Preliminary Engineering Project for Design, and Consulting Services to Coker Composting and Consulting in the amount of \$62,142 plus a 15% contingency of \$9,321 for a total cost not to exceed \$71,463*

BACKGROUND:

In 2010 the Appleton Wastewater Treatment Plant (AWWTP) initiated a pilot project approved by the WDNR to evaluate the feasibility of a large scale windrow composting facility (i.e., 5 acre site) located at the Outagamie County Recycling and Solid Waste facility (OCRSW). The pilot compost facility has an estimated maximum design capacity of 9,000 cubic yards of biosolids if a three bulk composting cycle regime is utilized. The pilot successfully demonstrated the ability to utilize windrow composting as a means to convert Class B biosolids to a Class A Exception Quality (EQ) biosolids compost. Since 2010, the pilot has transitioned to a Compost Program and was permitted by the WDNR on April 1, 2017. Since inception, the AWWTP has composted over 65,000 cu yards of raw organic materials (e.g. leaves, ground brush, and Class B biosolids) to produce approximately 40,000 cu yards of finished material.

The experience with compost gained over the past few years coupled with projected increased biosolids production, stringent regulations impacting land application, and the need communicated recently by OCRSW to utilize the existing compost processing pad as part of their next planned landfill expansion has led to the next step in the process. That step is to evaluate the viability of a concept biosolids compost facility and the technologies best suited for a hypothetical green-field site. The concept facility is to be scalable from 10,000 (comparable to current operations) to 40,000 wet tons (total projected future annual biosolids production). The consulting firm selected for this work will be tasked with developing a site plan for a green-field site that would best serve both the Appleton Department of Public Works (DPW) and the Utilities Department. As such, the hypothetical green-field site would not only convert Class B biosolids to a Class A EQ biosolids compost but would also provide an additional 40 acres for DPW annual leaf and snow storage needs. This project will require the selected firm to address processing technologies on a hypothetical site identified by the City. The firm will also provide

the AWWTP with an updated biosolids storage building construction cost. The building expansion construction estimate shall provide the AWWTP with a total 180-day storage capacity of 20,000 wet tons to meet future projected growth needs and will be used to compare against the selected compost technology option.

RFP PROCESS:

The request for proposal was distributed to five engineering firms. Two firms did not propose because of the minimum biosolids composting experience and qualifications stated in the request for proposal. Representatives from three firms attended a pre-proposal meeting that defined the project, scope, and held a question and answer session. The following table identifies the engineering firms along with their proposal score and proposal pricing:

Company	Total Score ⁽¹⁾	Quote Pricing	Points Value Factor	Final Ranking
Coker Composting & Consulting	154	\$62,142	2.5	1
Jacobs CH2M	180	\$97,026	1.9	2
SCS Engineers	136	\$87,270	1.6	3
AECOM	DNP			
HDR	DNP			

Notes:

1. “Total Score” represents the combined total from each of the three evaluation team members.
2. Point Value Factor Method = (Qualitative Proposal Score/ Quote Price) x 1,000. The highest point value factor derived is considered the best value proposal.
3. DNP – Did not Propose

An evaluation team completed their review of the submitted proposals. Firm proposals were evaluated and scored. The evaluation team found that Coker Composting and Consulting provided a proposal with the best value which met the City’s needs. Coker Composting and Consulting possesses diverse experience within biosolids composting and identified a comprehensive approach within their proposal to deliver the requisite project deliverables (e.g. Compost Technology Evaluation Report, Biosolids Storage Building Expansion Evaluation, and Economic Analysis).

RECOMMENDATION:

Approval of an Engineering contract for the Compost Facility Preliminary Engineering Project for Design and Consulting Services to Coker Composting and Consulting in the amount of \$62,142 plus a 15% contingency of \$9,321 for a total not to exceed cost of \$71,463.

If you have any questions or require additional information regarding this project please contact Chris Stempa at 920-832-5945.